QGIS Application - Bug report #9084
Mean coordinates-feature fails with negative weights

2013-11-19 03:39 AM - Noone Noone

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Normal		
Assignee:			
Category:	Processing/QGIS		
Affected QGIS version:	2.0.1	**Regression?:**	No
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	17729

Description

Calculating mean coordinates require negative weigths per definition.
The QGIS 2.0 feature sadly doesn't check nor notifies the user (that might not be aware on this fact), if he/she tries to do such a computation with a datafield that contains also negative values. This makes it pretty hard to detect the mistake and to get valid results.

Steps to reproduce:
*Add a point vector layer with a field that contains also negative values
*Select this layer and pick vector - analysis - mean coordinates
*Pick layer, pick field for weights and create a result layer
*See that the resulting mean coordinates are just the same, as the centeroid of the convex hull of all datapoints (so without influence of the weights)

Suggestions:
*Add a hint to the feature dialog
*Do a non-negative check before starting processing
*Giving hints that you can use the field-calculator

Associated revisions

Revision 4963548f - 2017-02-07 03:29 PM - Alexander Bruy

[processing] warn user about incorrect input data when calculating
mean coordinates using weight field (fix #9084)

History

#1 - 2013-11-19 09:53 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Category changed from Vectors to 44

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

- Target version set to Future Release - High Priority

> *Calculating mean coordinates require negative weigths per definition.*

do you mean "does not require", right?

#2 - 2013-11-19 11:55 AM - Noone Noone

Yes, it just works with positive values :)

#3 - 2014-06-21 03:36 PM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#4 - 2016-01-21 05:40 AM - Alexander Bruy

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

What is desired behaviour: skip features with negative values in weight field, or check weight field for negative values and abort algorithm if there are negative values?

#5 - 2016-01-21 05:43 AM - Paolo Cavallini

- Subject changed from Mean coordinates-feature fails with negative weightes to Mean coordinates-feature fails with negative weights

#6 - 2016-05-23 05:37 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

Alexander Bruy wrote:

> *What is desired behaviour: skip features with negative values in weight field, or check weight field for negative values and abort algorithm if there are negative values?*

I guess that stopping and warning the user is the right thing to do.

#7 - 2017-01-02 05:50 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Category changed from 44 to Processing/QGIS

#8 - 2017-02-07 06:26 AM - Alexander Bruy

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Fixed in changeset commit:"4963548f4db078940107637726936 8c4f8df8ec1".