QGIS Application - Bug report #7540
Merge tool bug when a shapefile is loaded multiple times

2013-04-07 07:33 PM - Olivier Dalang

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Severe/Regression		
Assignee:			
Category:	Digitising		
Affected QGIS version:	master	**Regression?:**	No
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	fixed/implemented
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	Yes	**Copied to github as #:**	16483

Description

Hi !

When a Shapefile is loaded multiple times (either in the same project via "duplicate layer" or in two different QGis instances), there is a critical bug upon merging features.

Both merged parts simply disappear without any error (though it seems sometimes QGis crashes).
To reproduce:

1. create a new shapefile (line or polygon)
2. enter edit mode
3. draw a feature and split it several times with the scissor tool
4. exit edit mode
5. duplicate the layer
6. enter edit mode on one of the two layers
7. select two line segments and merge them with the merge tool
8. exit edit mode
9. reload the project and see!!

Related issues:

Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 8822: OGR: Repack in running session	**Closed**	**2013-10-11**

Associated revisions

Revision 78b04df9 - 2013-07-09 04:25 PM - Jürgen Fischer

ogr provider: reopen the data source if a REPACK failed (fixes #7540)

Revision 7d7cdcd3 - 2015-05-28 12:34 PM - Matthias Kuhn

Repack shapefiles when saving after deleting features

- QgsVectorDataProvider::dataChanged() will be emitted
- QgsVectorLayer::dataChanged() will be emitted
- Clears QgsVectorLayerCache
- Reloads the attribute table
- Clears the selection

Looking forward to people complaining about their lost selection...

Fix #10560

Fix #11989

Refs #8317

Refs #8822

Refs #10483

Refs #11007

Refs #7540

Refs #11398

Refs #11296

History

#1 - 2013-04-08 02:07 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

it is a regression since 1.8? I'm not able to replicate the issue here, but maybe I'm doing it wrong.

#2 - 2013-04-08 03:58 PM - Olivier Dalang

Yes it's a regression, the problem does not show up in 1.8...

Here (Windows 7) it seems to happen every time when following those steps.

If confirmed, this should be a blocker, since it leads to data corruption.

#3 - 2013-04-08 03:59 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Priority changed from Normal to Severe/Regression

#4 - 2013-04-22 06:45 AM - Radim Blazek

> *9) reload the project and see !!*

What does it mean "reload the project"? Reopen project file or refresh display?

#5 - 2013-04-22 07:37 AM - Olivier Dalang

Actually, when you refresh display only :
- on the layer that was not edited, you see that the two merged parts have disappeared
- on the layer that was edited, you see the two merged parts plus the result of the merge

But actually, I'm just discovering that the shapefile seems in a deeper mess, even after reloading : if you create a new polygon, no matter what shape, it will take the shape of the result of the merge.

Here's a screencast of the procedure :
https://www.dropbox.com/s/84nj515s6mfu09f/mergeBug2.avi?m

#6 - 2013-06-02 01:47 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#7 - 2013-06-28 01:10 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Category set to Digitising

#8 - 2013-07-01 03:53 PM - Salvatore Larosa

is it still true ?

following the above steps I did not get any crash !
tested with a polygon layer and I do not see unusual behavior.

#9 - 2013-07-02 04:01 AM - Giovanni Manghi

> *following the above steps I did not get any crash !*
> *tested with a polygon layer and I do not see unusual behavior.*

I don't think it causes crash, it causes data corruption.

#10 - 2013-07-08 09:43 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> *I don't think it causes crash, it causes data corruption.*

So you can reproduce the problem? Just checking, if I should try harder...

#11 - 2013-07-09 12:40 AM - Giovanni Manghi

> *So you can reproduce the problem? Just checking, if I should try harder...*

no I can't.

Olivier still true for you?

#12 - 2013-07-09 01:26 AM - Olivier Dalang

Hi !

The behavior changed a little bit but I still get data corruption (with master from yesterday, under Windows 7).
It's no more necessary to reload the project to see the data loss.

Here's a screencast : https://www.dropbox.com/s/g70fkaus6j40vll/mergeBug4.avi

#13 - 2013-07-09 02:51 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

ok, I can reproduce it now.   I suspect it's a file locking issue in OGR (might be tied to windows). Looking into GDAL now...

#14 - 2013-07-09 03:30 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Assignee set to Jürgen Fischer

#15 - 2013-07-09 07:25 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Fixed in changeset commit:"78b04df91a1b85ee70ff5b326980f480b3069d47".

#16 - 2013-07-09 07:28 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Jürgen Fischer wrote:

> *Fixed in changeset commit:"78b04df91a1b85ee70ff5b326980f480b3069d47".*

It was caused by locking.   QGIS does a REPACK after deleting and that silently fails with current OGR.   GDAL pull request !#17 should fix this by adding an error message. reopening the original DBF if it can't be removed and cleaning up the *_packed.dbf.

Nevertheless QGIS now checks if there still is a *_packed.dbf to detect that the REPACK failed and reopens the dataset in that case.

#17 - 2014-10-04 01:48 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Closed to Reopened

- Target version changed from Version 2.0.0 to Version 2.6

Sorry to reopen this, seems master still affected. See also #11082

#18 - 2014-10-21 02:47 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Assignee deleted (Jürgen Fischer)

#19 - 2014-10-24 09:11 AM - Giovanni Manghi

it is pretty easy to replicate this issue, it is just needed to "insist" a bit. Here two screencast, that as some point show that after removing a shape and re-adding it features are lost!

The second show also a possible bug in the "split features" tool.

https://www.dropbox.com/s/rpjcn8gpn75r31m/t7540_1.mp4?dl=0

https://www.dropbox.com/s/9n9a7j1puugwpnr/t7540_2.mp4?dl=0

#20 - 2014-10-24 09:16 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> *Sorry to reopen this, seems master still affected. See also #11082*

after all it does not seems related... I have a VM with qgis running against gdal/ogr trunk and I can still see the issue described in this ticket.

#21 - 2014-10-30 07:13 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Reopened to Feedback

it seems this could have been solved by this commit:4cf08c5c112278ab4f50cf21b735a4a58d6a98aa

#22 - 2014-10-31 05:55 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Target version changed from Version 2.6 to Future Release - High Priority

#23 - 2014-11-03 02:51 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Feedback to Closed

- Resolution set to fixed/implemented

after commit:4cf08c5c112278ab4f50cf21b735a4a58d6a98aa I really cannot make to replicate this issue. That commit solves also partially #11007 (but only for the case of edited features, still there is an issue with deleted ones).

Please reopen if necessary.