

QGIS Application - Bug report #5602

Identify disabled in WMS for grouped layers

2012-05-15 08:02 AM - michele zanolli

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	Normal	
Assignee:		
Category:	Web Services clients/WMS	
Affected QGIS version:	master	Regression?: No
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution: wontfix
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 15175
Description		
<p>I have a WMS service (mapserver) like this:</p> <p>-group1 --layer1 --layer2 --layer3</p> <p>If I open separately layer1, layer2 and layer3 --> I can Identify features If I select layer1, layer2 and layer3 as a single layer in QGIS --> I can identify features If I select group1 as a single layer in QGIS --> QGIS does not let me identify the features (the identify tool is disaled)</p> <p>Why? If I use other WMS clients I can identify group1 as a normal WMS layer (Maybe it is not a bug, but a feature to be implemented)</p>		

History

#1 - 2012-05-15 08:06 AM - Giovanni Manghi

what platform and qgis version?

#2 - 2012-05-15 08:09 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

#3 - 2012-05-15 11:11 PM - michele zanolli

tested on:

- ubuntu 10.04 + qgis trunk
- win xp + qgis 1.7.4
- win server 2003 + qgis 1.7.4
- win 7 + qgis 1.7.4

All the same behaviour

#4 - 2012-06-16 02:34 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#5 - 2012-09-04 12:09 PM - Paolo Cavallini

- Target version set to Version 2.0.0

#6 - 2014-06-21 03:39 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Category set to GUI

#7 - 2014-06-21 03:40 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Category changed from GUI to Web Services clients/WMS

#8 - 2014-06-21 06:57 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Target version changed from Version 2.0.0 to Future Release - Nice to have

#9 - 2014-06-22 03:37 PM - Jürgen Fischer

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

not reproducible - works fine for me.

#10 - 2014-07-01 01:16 AM - michele zanolli

here an example of mapserver (6.4.1) mapfile not working for me:

MAP

```
NAME "test_wms"
EXTENT 648300 5090700 677500 5116000
UNITS meters
MAXSIZE 10000
IMAGECOLOR 255 255 255
RESOLUTION 96
CONFIG "PROJ_LIB" "/usr/local/share/proj/"
```

PROJECTION

```
"init=epsg:25832"
END
```

WEB

METADATA

```
"wms_title"          "test_wms"
"wms_onlineresource" "http://localhost/cgi-bin/mapserv?map=test_wms.map&"
"wms_srs"            "EPSG:25832"
"wms_feature_info_mime_type" "text/plain"
"wms_abstract"       "Abstract"
"wms_enable_request" "***"
```

END

IMAGEPATH "/tmp/"

END

LAYER

```
NAME "polygon_layer"
CONNECTIONTYPE postgis
CONNECTION "dbname=mydb host=localhost"
DATA "wkb_geometry FROM polygon_layer"
EXTENT 648300 5090700 677500 5116000
```

```

GROUP test_wms
TYPE POLYGON
STATUS OFF
SYMBOLSCALEDENOM 2000
TEMPLATE void
MINSCALEDENOM 50
METADATA
    "wms_title"          "polygon_layer"
    "wms_enable_request"  ""
END
CLASS
    NAME "polygon layer"
    STYLE
        WIDTH 3
        OUTLINECOLOR 255 0 255
        LINECAP butt
        PATTERN 8 4 END
    END
END
END

LAYER
    NAME "line_layer"
    CONNECTIONTYPE postgis
    CONNECTION "dbname=mydb host=localhost"
    DATA "wkb_geometry FROM line_layer"
    EXTENT 648300 5090700 677500 5116000
    GROUP test_wms
    TYPE LINE
    STATUS OFF
    TEMPLATE void
    SYMBOLSCALEDENOM 1000
    MINSCALEDENOM 50
    METADATA
        "wms_title"          "line_layer"
        "wms_enable_request"  ""
    END
    CLASS
        NAME "line layer"
        STYLE
            COLOR 255 0 0
            LINECAP butt
            WIDTH 2
            PATTERN 6 6 END
        END
    END
END

LAYER
    NAME "point_layer"
    CONNECTIONTYPE postgis
    CONNECTION "dbname=mydb host=localhost"
    DATA "wkb_geometry FROM point_layer"

```

```

EXTENT 648300 5090700 677500 5116000
GROUP test_wms
TYPE POINT
STATUS OFF
TEMPLATE void
SYMBOLSCALEDENOM 1000
MINSCALEDENOM 50
METADATA
  "wms_title"          "point_layer"
  "wms_enable_request" "***"
END
CLASS
  NAME "point layer"
  STYLE
    COLOR 0 0 0
    SYMBOL "circle"
    SIZE 8
  END
END
END
END
END

```

#11 - 2014-07-01 07:41 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#12 - 2015-12-09 05:24 AM - Médéric RIBREUX

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

Hello, bug triage...

I can't reproduce it on QGIS 2.13 master on BRGM WMS services on <http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie> . When I group 3 WMS layers on a single QGIS layer, I can use identify tool.

Can you confirm you don't have the bug with your previous configuration ?

#13 - 2015-12-26 12:33 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Resolution set to not reproducible

- Status changed from Feedback to Closed

closing for lack of feedback, reopen if necessary.

#14 - 2016-01-04 06:33 AM - michele zanolli

- Status changed from Closed to Reopened

Médéric RIBREUX wrote:

Hello, bug triage...

I can't reproduce it on QGIS 2.13 master on BRGM WMS services on <http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie> . When I group 3 WMS layers on a single QGIS layer, I can use identify tool.

Can you confirm you don't have the bug with your previous configuration ?

Hello Médéric,

what you are saying is correct, but my issue is a bit different: in your WMS example <http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie> try to open the WMS layer GEOLOGIE (id = 1). It is an aggregate of more layers. Can you identify that group? My Identify tool is greyed out

#15 - 2016-01-05 12:44 AM - Jukka Rahkonen

The reason is that in the GetCapabilities document that Mapserver creates the group layer is not marked as queryable. I hit the same issue yesterday when I tried to cascade WMS from Mapserver with Geoserver <https://lists.osgeo.org/pipermail/mapserver-users/2016-January/078538.html>. I would say that QGIS works as supposed and the bug is on the Mapserver side.

#16 - 2016-01-05 01:37 AM - michele zanolli

Thanks for the explanation, I agree with you. Only a precisation: if the WMS Client queries the group layer - even if it is not marked as queryable - mapserver responds correctly with GetFeatureInfo response.

#17 - 2016-01-05 02:17 AM - Jukka Rahkonen

Yes, but it seems to require that every individual layer in the group is queryable. If one layer is not queryable Mapserver turns the whole group non-queryable.

#18 - 2016-01-06 05:09 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Reopened to Closed

Jukka Rahkonen wrote:

Yes, but it seems to require that every individual layer in the group is queryable. If one layer is not queryable Mapserver turns the whole group non-queryable.

so it still seems something that depends on server configurations, right? please reopen if necessary.

#19 - 2016-01-06 11:32 PM - michele zanolli

Jukka Rahkonen wrote:

Yes, but it seems to require that every individual layer in the group is queryable. If one layer is not queryable Mapserver turns the whole group non-queryable.

In the Médéric's WMS example (<http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie>) if you try to open the 5 layers inside the group BSS (BSS_SEMIS_2, BSS_SEMIS_1, BSS_SEMIS_0, BSS_TOTAL_AVEC_LABEL, BSS_TOTAL_SANS_LABEL) they are all queryable. If you open the group BSS that contains those layers (id=19), it is not queryable

#20 - 2016-01-07 03:47 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Resolution deleted (not reproducible)
- Status changed from Closed to Reopened

michele zanolli wrote:

Jukka Rahkonen wrote:

Yes, but it seems to require that every individual layer in the group is queryable. If one layer is not queryable Mapserver turns the whole group non-queryable.

In the Médéric's WMS example (<http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie>) if you try to open the 5 layers inside the group BSS (BSS_SEMIS_2, BSS_SEMIS_1, BSS_SEMIS_0, BSS_TOTAL_AVEC_LABEL, BSS_TOTAL_SANS_LABEL) they are all queryable. If you open the group BSS that contains those layers (id=19), it is not queryable

#21 - 2016-01-07 03:48 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

michele zanolli wrote:

Jukka Rahkonen wrote:

Yes, but it seems to require that every individual layer in the group is queryable. If one layer is not queryable Mapserver turns the whole group non-queryable.

In the Médéric's WMS example (<http://geoservices.brgm.fr/geologie>) if you try to open the 5 layers inside the group BSS (BSS_SEMIS_2, BSS_SEMIS_1, BSS_SEMIS_0, BSS_TOTAL_AVEC_LABEL, BSS_TOTAL_SANS_LABEL) they are all queryable. If you open the group BSS that contains those layers (id=19), it is not queryable

so it needs further tests.

#22 - 2016-01-08 07:27 AM - Jukka Rahkonen

I need to clarify:

- With Mapserver group layer is never announced as queryable in the GetCapabilities
- However, if all the layers in the group are queryable, it is possible to query the group by making a GetFeatureInfo request with &QUERY_LAYERS=group (but QGIS does not know that)
- If at least one layer in the group is not queryable then the group is not queryable either and GetFeatureInfo with &QUERY_LAYERS=group will yield an exception from Mapserver.

This behaviour makes it tricky to program a workaround on QGIS side. QGIS should check that the WMS server is Mapserver with some heuristics, and if

it is, then check if all the layers in the group are queryable. If they are the group is queryable as well. Brute force approach would be just to fire GetFeatureInfo always - if layer or group is not queryable the server will tell it by sending an exception.

I think that this is not a bug in QGIS and the right place to fix the issue is on the Mapserver side.

#23 - 2016-01-08 02:42 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- *Status changed from Reopened to Feedback*

#24 - 2016-04-09 11:41 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- *Resolution set to wontfix*

- *Status changed from Feedback to Closed*

| *I think that this is not a bug in QGIS and the right place to fix the issue is on the Mapserver side.*

closing for lack of feedback. Please reopen if necessary.