

QGIS Application - Feature request #2542

field calculator default behaviour

2010-03-11 12:44 AM - Bernhard Ströbl

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	Low	
Assignee:	Marco Hugentobler	
Category:	Vectors	
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution: fixed
Easy fix?:	No	Copied to github as #: 12602
Description <p>Thank you for the field calculator it is a very welcome feature!</p> <p>However its default behaviour (checkbox settings) is to update all records in the first existing field. This applies to QGIS 1.4.0-2.8 (OpenSuse).</p> <p>To prevent users from corrupting their data I would expect it the other way round: update only selected records and ask for a new field.</p> Explanation <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Most of the time I am using the field calculator, I want to update only selected records (graphical or logical selection). So I have to take extra care to check <i>only update selected features</i>. When I forget to do so, my data already being in the target field are gone. On the other hand if I want to update all records and the default would be <i>only update selected features</i> all I have to do is redoing the calculation after unchecking <i>only update selected features</i>.- The first existing field normally is an ID field. You do not want to update this field! But if you do not take extra care you do so. If <i>update existing field</i> would be unchecked the user has to do something in order to execute the calculation: either check <i>update existing field</i> and choose the field or enter a new field. Thus the risk of data corruption by accident is minimized. <p>I am totally aware that discarding the changes keeps the data as they are. But it is annoying to stop the edit mode, discard all(!) changes and redo all I did when I realize I made a mistake (if I realize!).</p> Proposal <ul style="list-style-type: none">- If a selection exists on the table check <i>only update selected features</i> by default.- Uncheck <i>update existing field</i> by default.		

History

#1 - 2010-03-11 01:04 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Replying to [best](#):

| I am totally aware that discarding the changes keeps the data as they are. But it is annoying to stop the edit mode, discard all(!) changes and redo all I did when I realize I made a mistake (if I realize!).

You can also undo (and redo) field calculator changes - without leaving editing mode.

#2 - 2010-03-11 01:56 AM - Bernhard Ströbl

Replying to [comment:1 jef]:

| You can also undo (and redo) field calculator changes - without leaving editing mode.

Didn't know that, although I was looking for it (only in the table window, though :) I still think the current default settings are more error-prone than my proposal.

#3 - 2010-03-11 02:32 AM - Marco Hugentobler

The proposed changes sound good to me. I'm going to look at it.

#4 - 2010-03-11 03:00 AM - Marco Hugentobler

- *Resolution set to fixed*
- *Status changed from Open to Closed*

Fixed in commit:ccb101c1 (SVN r13047)

#5 - 2010-03-11 04:35 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Replying to [comment:2 best]:

Replying to [comment:1 jef]:

You can also undo (and redo) field calculator changes - without leaving editing mode.

Didn't know that, although I was looking for it (only in the table window, though :)

I still think the current default settings are more error-prone than my proposal.

Sure. I wasn't implying that your proposal was bad. I just thought you should know about another "very welcome feature". ;)