QGIS Application - Bug report #20541
"Topology Checker" and multipart (shapefiles)

2018-11-18 02:44 PM - Thomas Nogatz

Status:	Open		
Priority:	Normal		
Assignee:			
Category:	C++ plugins/Topology checker		
Affected QGIS version:	3.7(master)	**Regression?:**	No
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	28361

Description

New description:

In QGIS 3 shapefiles are now **always** multipart, so the Topology Checker rule "must not have muultipart feature" always return errors for such datasource.

Old description:

Prerequisite: Polygon shape (see attached shapefile) with clean topology after im- and export with GRASS (v.in.ogr.qgis, snapping threshold 0.1 m):
without invalid/overlapping/multipart geometries, without duplicates, with some allowed gaps.

Observation:
QGIS 2.18 - Topology Checker (check on invalid/overlapping/multipart/duplicates/gaps) recognizes the gaps. That's correct.
QGIS 3.4.1 - same topology check: The gaps are recognized and a lot of multipart features are reported. But there are no multipart features - so this should be an error.

History

#1 - 2018-11-19 10:42 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

in QGIS 3 shapefiles are always forced as multipart, so I guess that the tool should consider shapefiles as a special case.

#2 - 2019-03-09 09:31 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Operating System deleted (Windows 7)
- Affected QGIS version changed from 3.4.1 to 3.7(master)
- Status changed from Feedback to Open
- Description updated
- Subject changed from Plugin "Topology Checker" - false error report: Multipart Features to "Topology Checker" and multipart (shapefiles)
- Category changed from Vectors to C++ plugins/Topology checker

#3 - 2019-04-02 12:25 PM - Dario Bevilacqua

I have the same problem. I need to check the singlepart and the multipart features and since qgis 3.x it is no more possible.
The command in python 3 (geom.isMultipart()), same as for qgis gui and plugin, return always multipart, even if the geom is single part.
The same file in qgis 2.x and python 2 return the check as "single part".

It's pretty ridiculous that I have to check the geometry with an old and outdated version of qgis. It will be fixed?

#4 - 2019-04-02 12:50 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Dario Bevilacqua wrote:

> *pretty ridiculous*

?

have you seen #20541-1 ?

also if there is some bug/regression that is a blocker for your workflow please consider supporting the effort for fixing it, rather than ranting about it.

Files

FFH_326.zip	164 KB	2018-11-18	Thomas Nogatz