

QGIS Application - Bug report #19708

Processing: Join attributes by location produces duplicated fid

2018-08-27 03:33 PM - Jérôme Guélat

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	Normal	
Assignee:		
Category:	Processing/QGIS	
Affected QGIS version:	3.2.2	Regression?: No
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution:
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		Copied to github as #: 27533
Description Here's how to reproduce the bug: <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Add the 2 layers (pol1 and pol2) from the attached GeoPackage2. In Processing, open Join attributes by location3. Input layer: pol1; join layer: pol2; geometric predicate: within4. Don't specify an output file (use a temporary layer)5. The resulting layer will have 2 features with the same fid, and hence can't be saved to a new GeoPackage without manually editing the fid values6. If you save directly to a GeoPackage (instead of using a temporary layer), one feature will be lost. Suprisingly, this doesn't happen if you save directly to a Shapefile I know it is uncommon to use a spatial join with perfectly overlapping geometries in the joined layer, but it would be nice to have a consistent behaviour between different output formats.		
Related issues:		
Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 19758: Processing: merge vector la...		Open 2018-09-03
Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 19998: Cannot export output of 'Po...		Closed 2018-10-02

Associated revisions

Revision f8d873c7 - 2018-10-31 10:27 AM - Matthias Kuhn

Regenerate fids for "join attributes by location"

Fix #19708

Revision 1d474d8e - 2018-10-31 01:48 PM - Matthias Kuhn

Regenerate fids for "join attributes by location"

Fix #19708

History

#1 - 2018-08-27 04:07 PM - Jérôme Guélat

Note that something similar happens with the Intersection algorithm (and maybe with other algorithms based on overlays).

#2 - 2018-08-30 01:43 AM - Giovanni Manghi
- *Operating System deleted (Windows 7)*

Confirmed here. I think that especially the result of the operation 6 ("If you save directly to a GeoPackage (instead of using a temporary layer), one feature will be lost") is particularly problematic.

#3 - 2018-09-17 10:20 AM - Jérôme Guélat

After further testing, this also applies when the geometries are not perfectly overlapping (use intersect instead of within as a geometric predicate)... The problem happens when one feature from the input layer has at least 2 intersecting features in the join layer (and we perform a one-to-many spatial join).

See also #19758

#4 - 2018-10-08 12:47 PM - Andrea Giudiceandrea
- *Related to Bug report #19758: Processing: merge vector layers produces duplicated fid added*

#5 - 2018-10-08 12:47 PM - Andrea Giudiceandrea
- *Related to Bug report #19998: Cannot export output of 'Points along geometry' tool as Geopackage added*

#6 - 2018-10-31 09:15 AM - Matthias Kuhn
- *Status changed from Open to In Progress*

<https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/pull/8240>

#7 - 2018-10-31 01:46 PM - Anonymous
- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*
- *Status changed from In Progress to Closed*

Applied in changeset commit:qgis|f8d873c7cb44adada2ab38a5f1dad6a96adf8e14.

Files			
testgeom.gpkg	136 KB	2018-08-27	Jérôme Guélat