

QGIS Application - Bug report #18286
cannot filter by \$geometry, \$length, \$area etc.

2018-03-01 11:52 AM - Mattias Spangmyr

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:	Hugo Mercier	
Category:	Attribute table	
Affected QGIS version:	3.3(master)	Regression?: Yes
Operating System:	Ubuntu 16.04	Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch applied:	No	Resolution:
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 26177
Description		
<p>The "Advanced Filter (Expression)" function of the Attribute Table does not seem to be able to filter by comparing the current feature's geometry (\$geometry) to NULL.</p> <p>Applying either of the following expressions filters nothing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- \$geometry IS NULL- \$geometry IS NOT NULL <p>Both of the above expressions work when using "Select features using an expression", so its still possible to find null geometries that way.</p>		

Associated revisions

Revision d9a10280 - 2018-10-24 10:12 AM - Hugo Mercier

Attribute table filter: force geometry extraction when needed

Fixes #18286

History

#1 - 2018-03-01 11:54 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

What about QGIS 3?

#2 - 2018-03-02 01:10 PM - Mattias Spangmyr

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

What about QGIS 3?

I tested in QGIS 3.0.0 just now and the behaviour is exactly the same as far as I can see. However, I need to revise my description as the expression "\$geometry IS NOT NULL" actually does filter, only it does not show any features either with or without geometry.

My version (on Win 7 64-bit):

QGIS version 3.0.0-Girona QGIS code revision 001c80b0c3
Compiled against Qt 5.9.2 Running against Qt 5.9.2
Compiled against GDAL/OGR 2.2.3 Running against GDAL/OGR 2.2.3
Compiled against GEOS 3.5.0-CAPI-1.9.0 Running against GEOS 3.5.0-CAPI-1.9.0 r4084
PostgreSQL Client Version 9.2.4 SpatiaLite Version 4.3.0
QWT Version 6.1.3 QScintilla2 Version 2.10.1
PROJ.4 Version 493

#3 - 2018-03-03 06:33 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Subject changed from *Advanced Filter (Expression) unable to filter by \$geometry IS NULL to Advanced Filter (Expression) in attribute table unable to filter by \$geometry IS NULL*
- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.18.16 to 3.0.0
- Operating System deleted (Windows 7)

#4 - 2018-10-15 09:34 AM - Tudor Bărașcu

Just filling out a bug report when I noticed this one.

Filtering a line or polygon layer by \$length or \$area doesn't work:

Steps to reproduce:

- Open attribute table
- Select Advanced Filter (Expression)
- Create a simple expression: length bigger than 10 meters (for my case): \$length > 10
- I noticed that in the Output preview window I get 0 or 1 (True or False) but in the attribute table all the rows dissapear (making the expression \$length <= 10 does the same)

Tested on QGIS Master (3.3) and 2.18

@Giovanni Maybe the issue name should be changed to "cannot filter by \$geometry, \$length, \$area etc.

#5 - 2018-10-15 09:52 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Subject changed from *Advanced Filter (Expression) in attribute table unable to filter by \$geometry IS NULL to cannot filter by \$geometry, \$length, \$area etc.*
- Affected QGIS version changed from 3.0.0 to 3.3(master)

#6 - 2018-10-22 01:38 PM - Tudor Bărașcu

- File *atr_bug.jpg* added

@Giovanni I think this issue should have a High priority as I discovered more problems (consequences) tied to it.

For example, any form constraints that use the geometry in any way work well in feature forms but are not working as expected in the attribute table.

I've attached a screenshot.

For the same feature, the "single" form passes the constraints whereas the same form in the attribute table doesn't so the editors are not guided well from the attribute table.

vane - Feature Attributes

Actions

Caracteristici principale Amplasament Alte detalii Schemă Mentenanță

id	55800	Identificator	
Distribuitor	APAVIL	Precizie nod	Precisă
Tip	vană	Cotă nod	240.397
Funcție	vană cu sertar	Referință cotă	sol
Diametru nominal	100	Precizie altimetrică nod	Mai bună de 5 cm
Conductă	16753	Precizie tijă	Precisă
Închisă	<input type="checkbox"/>	Cotă tijă	240.414
Acționare	manuală	Precizie altimetrică tijă	Mai bună de 10 cm
Stare	Funcțional		

Observații

OK Cancel

vane :: Features Total: 3174, Filtered: 1, Selected: 1

123 id = E

Update Filtered Update Selected

Expression

55800

Caracteristici principale Amplasament Alte detalii Schemă Mentenanță

id	55800	Identificator	
Distribuitor	APAVIL	Precizie nod	Precisă
Tip	vană	Cotă nod	240.397
Funcție	vană cu sertar	Referință cotă	sol
Diametru nominal	100	Precizie altimetrică nod	Mai bună de 5 cm
Conductă	16753	Precizie tijă	Precisă
Închisă	<input type="checkbox"/>	Cotă tijă	240.414

Show Selected Features

#7 - 2018-10-22 07:33 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Regression? changed from No to Yes
- Priority changed from Normal to High

Tudor Bărașcu wrote:

@Giovanni I think this issue should have a High priority as I discovered more problems (consequences) tied to it.
For example, any form constraints that use the geometry in any way work well in feature forms but are not working as expected in the attribute table.

I assume this is a regression(?).

#8 - 2018-10-24 09:18 AM - Hugo Mercier
- Assignee set to Hugo Mercier

Confirmed.

When tested with a shapefile, "\$" fields do not work. However, when trying with a memory layer it works.

#9 - 2018-10-24 09:22 AM - Nyal Dawson

This is because attribute table doesn't fetch geometries (for performance reasons).

#10 - 2018-10-24 09:31 AM - Hugo Mercier

Hmmm, apparently the filter can fetch geometries when needed (this is what I observe with memory layers)

<https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/blob/master/src/app/qgsattributetabledialog.cpp#L1106>

#11 - 2018-10-24 10:16 AM - Hugo Mercier
- Pull Request or Patch supplied changed from No to Yes
- Status changed from Open to In Progress

PR <https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/pull/8298>

#12 - 2018-10-24 11:39 AM - Hugo Mercier
- Status changed from In Progress to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset commit:qgis|d9a10280eb1d10f19457e845bda8b80d128d19c4.

Files			
test.zip	1.47 KB	2018-03-01	Mattias Spangmyr
atr_bug.jpg	101 KB	2018-10-22	Tudor Bărăscu