

QGIS Application - Bug report #17272

QGIS shows different geometry type in layer 'information' then ogrinfo

2017-10-12 03:02 PM - Richard Duivenvoorde

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	Normal	
Assignee:		
Category:	Data Provider/OGR	
Affected QGIS version:	master	Regression?: No
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution:
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		Copied to github as #: 25170
Description		
<p>Now that we go 3D...</p> <p>Loading a 3D polygon layer, for example this GDB: http://services.arcgisonline.nl/3D_kaart_NL/25qn1.zip</p> <p>The provider (ogrinfo reports the geometries as: 3D Multi Polygon</p> <p>While QGIS in it's Layer Properties/Information panel shows them as: Geometry Polygon (MultiPolygon25D)</p> <p>See screen shot..</p> <p>From Martin I understand there are 'different' types of 3D: https://github.com/qgis/QGIS-Enhancement-Proposals/issues/105#issuecomment-336051394</p> <p>But at least QGIS should show I think the right result?</p> <p>Screenie attached</p>		

History

#1 - 2017-11-10 11:52 PM - Even Rouault

This is just a terminology difference. 25D = 2.5D. Probably that the "3D MultiPolygon" in ogrinfo is not appropriate, since a multipolygon is supposed to be a planar thing, so at best 2.5D. Perhaps MultiPolygonZ would be a more neutral terminology. The only real 3D geometry is a PolyhedralSurface (not sure if that's handled by QGIS yet)

#2 - 2017-11-11 10:33 AM - Richard Duivenvoorde

Feel free to close this.

My point is just that I think 'notable geofoss tools' should use the same (and preferably professionally right) names and definitions for everything.

And I'm aware that this is more difficult with a widespread/anarchitic bunch of coders (compared to a dictotarial multinational), but I think we at least should try :-)

@even: is it worth starting a discussion about this (both on GDAL an QGIS lists?) so we can hopefully come to a shared (documented) definition?
Else: just close it.

#3 - 2019-03-09 04:28 PM - Giovanni Manghi
- *Status changed from Open to Feedback*

Please check if this issue is still valid on QGIS 3.4.5 or 3.6.

#4 - 2019-03-10 08:26 PM - Richard Duivenvoorde
- *Status changed from Feedback to Closed*

Files			
howmuchD.png	879 KB	2017-10-12	Richard Duivenvoorde