

QGIS Application - Bug report #17162

Processing: select by location does not work in the modeller

2017-09-19 08:53 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	Normal	
Assignee:	Victor Olaya	
Category:	Processing/Modeller	
Affected QGIS version:	2.18.12	Regression?: No
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution: invalid
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 25061
Description		
Within a model the "select by location" (followed by a "save selected features") tool does not work, the result is always an error		
Error executing algorithm Save selected features There are no selected features in the input layer.		
Tested on Linux and Windows on 2.18.13		
Related issues:		
Related to QGIS Application - Feature request # 17211: remove/hide the "selec...		Closed 2017-09-28

History

#1 - 2017-09-26 06:21 PM - Harrissou Santanna

Giovanni, does it work when using directly from the toolbox for you?

I tried using it (with eg contains or intersect predicates) and fail to return any feature. Same layers used with the Clip algorithm return expected (clipped) features.

I'm on master 8902d5f48f

#2 - 2017-09-26 06:23 PM - Harrissou Santanna

Ah sorry, Just realized that this is a 2.18 bug report. Do you think I should open a master-related ticket ?

#3 - 2017-09-26 06:43 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Harrissou Santanna wrote:

Giovanni, does it work when using directly from the toolbox for you?

I tried using it (with eg contains or intersect predicates) and fail to return any feature. Same layers used with the Clip algorithm return expected (clipped) features.

I'm on master 8902d5f48f

Can you check if your inputs have multipart geometries? Now that you say that I remember having issues with inputs with multipart geometries, if confirmed (that works only with singlepart inputs) then a new ticket should be filed.

I'm not duplicating tickets for 2.18 and master, not until now at least.

#4 - 2017-09-27 12:23 AM - Nyall Dawson

Harrissou - can you share your data? I'll look into this.

#5 - 2017-09-27 10:44 AM - Alexander Bruy

Use "Extract by Location" instead, it was added to overcome this issue.

#6 - 2017-09-27 12:58 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Alexander Bruy wrote:

| *Use "Extract by Location" instead, it was added to overcome this issue.*

Can we hide (in the modeler) the one that does not work in the modeler?

#7 - 2017-09-27 06:33 PM - Harrissou Santanna

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

| *Alexander Bruy wrote:*

| *Use "Extract by Location" instead, it was added to overcome this issue.*

| *Can we hide (in the modeler) the one that does not work in the modeler?*

In which case a message advising to use the extract tool instead of select tool in modeler should be added (in the select tool help).

| *Can you check if your inputs have multipart geometries?*

They are indeed. `st_geometrytype(geom)` returns `ST_MULTIPOLYGON` for both layers though no multiple parts features is concerned in the extent I'm trying to select from.

When I launch the selection command, the dialog is closed almost instantly and I have no message

Nyall, in order to send you data, I save as shapefile the layer from which i wanted to select features. Then I run a select by location test against that new layer. And weirdly things went nicely.

Checking the geometrytype of the features from the virtual layers dialog, select `st_geometrytype(geometry)`, `st_numgeometries(geometry)` from myshapefilelayer returns the same result as with my original PostgreSQL layers.

These are the commands from Processing History

```
processing.run("native:selectbylocation", {'INPUT':'//serveur/Serveur  
CAUE/SIG/DATA_2/TEMP/qgis_issues/sele_loc_issues.shp', 'PREDICATE':[0], 'INTERSECT':QgsProcessingFeatureSourceDefinition('perimetre_operationnel2  
operationnel20160505180346904', True), 'METHOD':0})
```

```
processing.run("native:selectbylocation", {'INPUT':{'dbname='ref' host=localhost port=5432 user='delazj' sslmode=disable key='ogc_fid'  
table='cadastre'.geo_parcelle' (geom)
```

```
sql=', 'PREDICATE':[0], 'INTERSECT': QgsProcessingFeatureSourceDefinition('perimetre_operationnel20160505180346904', True), 'METHOD': 0))
```

Running them in the python console succeeds for the shapefile and for the postgis layer returns

Traceback (most recent call last):

```
File "C:\OSGEO4~1\apps\Python36\lib\code.py", line 64, in runsourcel
code = self.compile(source, filename, symbol)
File "C:\OSGEO4~1\apps\Python36\lib\codeop.py", line 168, in __call__
return _maybe_compile(self.compiler, source, filename, symbol)
File "C:\OSGEO4~1\apps\Python36\lib\codeop.py", line 99, in _maybe_compile
raise err1
File "C:\OSGEO4~1\apps\Python36\lib\codeop.py", line 87, in _maybe_compile
code1 = compiler(source + "\n", filename, symbol)
File "C:\OSGEO4~1\apps\Python36\lib\codeop.py", line 133, in __call__
codeob = compile(source, filename, symbol, self.flags, 1)
File "<input>", line 1
processing.run("native:selectbylocation", {'INPUT': 'dbname='ref' host=localhost port=5432 user='delazj' sslmode=disable key='ogc_fid'
table='cadastre'.geo_parcelle' (geom)
sql=', 'PREDICATE':[0], 'INTERSECT': QgsProcessingFeatureSourceDefinition('perimetre_operationnel20160505180346904',
True), 'METHOD': 0))
```

^

SyntaxError: invalid syntax

Hope that helps

#8 - 2017-09-27 11:06 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Hi Harrissou

Can you check if your inputs have multipart geometries?

They are indeed.

I'm personally unable to replicate the issues with multipart geoms in 2.18.13... I might recall incorrectly or just using the wrong dataset.

If you confirm issues on master this would need a separate ticket as anyway this must be closed to make a feature request (remove/hide the "select by location" tool from modeller).

cheers!

#9 - 2017-09-28 12:15 AM - Nyal Dawson

Harrissou what about dumping the sql from the tables?

```
processing.run("native:selectbylocation", {'INPUT': 'dbname='ref' host=localhost port=5432 user='delazj' sslmode=disable key='ogc_fid'
table='cadastre'.geo_parcelle' (geom)
sql=', 'PREDICATE':[0], 'INTERSECT': QgsProcessingFeatureSourceDefinition('perimetre_operationnel20160505180346904',
True), 'METHOD': 0))
```

^

SyntaxError: invalid syntax

Can you file a separate bug for this one? ("processing history doesn't handle postgres source tables correctly")

#10 - 2017-09-28 09:25 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- *Status changed from Open to Closed*
- *Resolution set to invalid*

Replaced by #17211

#11 - 2017-09-28 09:28 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- *Related to Feature request #17211: remove/hide the "select by location" tool from modeller added*