

QGIS Application - Feature request #16974

Merge Selected Features - warn user in advance when merged geometry type does not match layer geometry type

2017-08-06 10:55 AM - Peteris Bruns

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:	Giovanni Manghi	
Category:	Editing	
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution: duplicate
Easy fix?:	No	Copied to github as #: 24873
Description <p>In case when merged geometry type does not match layer geometry type warning should appear already in Merge Selected Features dialogue, not after several 10 object merge on Save receive surprise message. This makes bad user experience since in message is not possible to identify wrong geometry/feature.</p> <p>Solution would be to warn user already in Merge Selected Features dialogue in case when merged feature final geometry type is not equal to target layer geometry type.</p> <p>As in example.png</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- ShapeFile/PostGIS layer with geometry type LineString.- several Linestring features.- try to merge 2 features without common start/end points, result is MultiLineString (in dialogue should be as minimum warning, probably disabled OK button while resulting geometry is not compatible with target layer geometry type) <p>In cases when user has merged several features, a+b=a Linestring, c+d=c Multilinestring on save both changes from QGIS is received message</p> <p>"Could not commit changes to layer LineString Layer Errors: ERROR: 2 feature(s) not added - geometry type is not compatible with the current layer." but this message does not help to identify wrong feature and fix it. Usually user cancels edit and loses all work without save and repeats feature merge again while faces the problematic features and fixes.</p> <p>Related to issues #15741 #16792</p>		

History

#1 - 2017-08-06 06:49 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Easy fix? changed from Yes to No
- Status changed from Open to Feedback

Actually this WAS the way QGIS used to work.

In fact in QGIS 2.14 trying to create a multi part geometry in a non multi part layer resulted in CLEAR message BEFORE the user clicked on "save edits".

See #15741-3

if this not fixed as the above ticket suggest than #15741 must be reopened.

#2 - 2017-08-08 09:02 PM - Peteris Bruns

- File bug_examples.gpkg added
- File vokoscreen-2017-08-08_21-47-26.mkv added

Thanks for pointing #15741-3, in QGIS 2.18.11 I can't see message and behavior as described in #15741-3.

Testing with QGIS 2.18.11, linestring layer (GPKG, ESRI ShapeFile, memory layer). Attached data example and video.

First merges is OK, the 2nd is buggy.

In this case is visually clear wich merge is buggy, but if user has made several, 10 and more, similar merge actions before save, then from save message is impossible to identify where is bug. Cancel all edits and start again.

So far seems that #15741 must be reopened.

#3 - 2017-08-09 09:17 PM - Peteris Bruns
- Assignee set to Giovanni Manghi

#15741 must be reopened.

#4 - 2017-08-10 11:18 AM - Giovanni Manghi
- Status changed from Feedback to Closed
- Resolution set to duplicate

done.

Files			
example.png	239 KB	2017-08-06	Peteris Bruns
vokoscreen-2017-08-08_21-47-26.mkv	1020 KB	2017-08-08	Peteris Bruns
bug_examples.gpkg	108 KB	2017-08-08	Peteris Bruns